## Radical Ideals and their Varieties

## The Strong Nullstellensatz

Priyank Kalla

## THE (U) <br> UNIVERSITY <br> ${ }^{0} \mathrm{~F} \mathrm{UTAH}$

Associate Professor
Electrical and Computer Engineering, University of Utah
kalla@ece.utah.edu
http://www.ece.utah.edu/~kalla

Nov 6, 2017 - onwards

## Agenda

- Study (strong/exact) relationships between ideals and varieties
- Based on the Regular and Strong Nullstellensatz result
- These results are needed for word-level verification of circuits
- The remaining concepts that enable complete hardware verification:
- Study Nullstellensatz over algebraically closed fields
- Then study Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{2^{k}}$ and hardware design (I'll give you my textbook chapters)
- Then apply Nullstellensatz specifically over $\mathbb{F}_{2^{k}}$ to verify digital circuits
- We should be able to study these basic concepts in the next 3-4 lectures and then apply these concepts to practical datapath circuits.


## Before we get to Strong Nullstellensatz...

Some more concepts about Varieties

- Let $\mathbb{F}$ be a field and $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary point


## Before we get to Strong Nullstellensatz...

Some more concepts about Varieties

- Let $\mathbb{F}$ be a field and $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary point
- a is a variety of some ideal: find $J$ s.t. $V(J)=\{a\}$


## Before we get to Strong Nullstellensatz...

Some more concepts about Varieties

- Let $\mathbb{F}$ be a field and $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary point
- a is a variety of some ideal: find $J$ s.t. $V(J)=\{a\}$
- $J=\langle x-a\rangle$


## Before we get to Strong Nullstellensatz...

Some more concepts about Varieties

- Let $\mathbb{F}$ be a field and $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary point
- a is a variety of some ideal: find $J$ s.t. $V(J)=\{a\}$
- $J=\langle x-a\rangle$


## Before we get to Strong Nullstellensatz...

Some more concepts about Varieties

- Let $\mathbb{F}$ be a field and $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary point
- a is a variety of some ideal: find $J$ s.t. $V(J)=\{a\}$
- $J=\langle x-a\rangle$


## $V_{1} \cup V_{2}$ and $V_{1} \cap V_{2}$

Finite unions and intersections of varieties are also varieties. Let $V_{1}=V\left(f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right)$ and $V_{2}=V\left(g_{1}, \ldots, g_{t}\right)$ :

- $V_{1} \cap V_{2}=V\left(f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, g_{1}, \ldots, g_{t}\right)$
- $V_{1} \cup V_{2}=V\left(f_{i} \cdot g_{j}: 1 \leq i \leq s, 1 \leq j \leq t\right)$

Example: Consider the union of the $(x, y)$-plane and the $z$-axis. Then:
$V(z) \cup V(x, y)=V(z x, z y)$

## Consequently...

- Every finite set of points is a variety of some ideal $V(J)$
- Prove it!
- Example:
- The Galois field $\mathbb{F}_{2}=\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ is a finite set of points (2)
- $\mathbb{F}_{2}=V\left(J_{0}\right)$, where $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{2}-x\right\rangle$ the ideal of vanishing polynomial

Other notations:

- Let ideal $I=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{r}\right\rangle, J=\left\langle g_{1}, \ldots, g_{s}\right\rangle$, then:
- $I+J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{r}, g_{1}, \ldots, g_{s}\right\rangle$, and $V(I+J)=V(I) \cap V(J)$
- $I \cdot J=\left\langle f_{i} \cdot g_{j}: 1 \leq i \leq r, 1 \leq j \leq s\right\rangle$, and $V(I \cdot J)=V(I) \cup V(J)$

Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?

Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!

Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- Example:


## Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- Example:
- $I_{1}=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I_{2}=\langle x, y\rangle$


## Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- Example:
- $I_{1}=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I_{2}=\langle x, y\rangle$
- $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)=\{(0,0)\}$, but $I_{1} \neq I_{2},\left(I_{1} \subset I_{2}\right)$


## Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- Example:
- $I_{1}=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I_{2}=\langle x, y\rangle$
- $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)=\{(0,0)\}$, but $I_{1} \neq I_{2},\left(I_{1} \subset I_{2}\right)$
- Different ideals can have the same variety!


## Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- Example:
- $I_{1}=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I_{2}=\langle x, y\rangle$
- $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)=\{(0,0)\}$, but $I_{1} \neq I_{2},\left(I_{1} \subset I_{2}\right)$
- Different ideals can have the same variety!
- But $I_{1}$ and $I_{2}$ are somehow related....


## Now some fun stuff for Nullstellensatz

- If ideals $I_{1}=I_{2}$, is $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$ ?
- Yes, of course!
- If $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)$, is $I_{1}=I_{2}$ ?
- No! Not always. Maybe $I_{1}=I_{2}$, but not always.
- Example:
- $I_{1}=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I_{2}=\langle x, y\rangle$
- $V\left(I_{1}\right)=V\left(I_{2}\right)=\{(0,0)\}$, but $I_{1} \neq I_{2},\left(I_{1} \subset I_{2}\right)$
- Different ideals can have the same variety!
- But $I_{1}$ and $I_{2}$ are somehow related....
- Nullstellensatz describes these relationships exactly


## $I(V(J))$ : Ideal of polynomials that vanishes on the variety $V(J)$

## I(V)

Let $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subset \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$. Then:
$I(V(J))=\left\{f \in \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]: f(\mathbf{a})=0 \forall \mathbf{a} \in V(J)\right\}$

- I(V(J)) is the set of all polynomials that vanish on $V(J)$
- If $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then $f \in I(V(J))$
- Can you prove that $I(V(J))$ is indeed an ideal?
- Example:
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, f=x, f \notin J, f \in I(V(J))$
- In a general setting: given generators of
$J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, not easy to find generators of $I(V(J))$
- Over algebraically closed fields, $I(V(J))$ is related to $J$ via $\sqrt{J}$ [details in the next few slides]


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}+1\right\rangle, V_{\mathbb{R}}(J)=\emptyset, I(V(J))=I$ (empty) $=\mathbb{R}[x]$; here $J \subset I(V(J))$


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}+1\right\rangle, V_{\mathbb{R}}(J)=\emptyset, I(V(J))=I$ (empty) $=\mathbb{R}[x]$; here $J \subset I(V(J))$
- Over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$, let $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{q}-x\right\rangle$


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}+1\right\rangle, V_{\mathbb{R}}(J)=\emptyset, I(V(J))=I$ (empty) $=\mathbb{R}[x]$; here $J \subset I(V(J))$
- Over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$, let $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{q}-x\right\rangle$
- What is $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ? $I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ?


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}+1\right\rangle, V_{\mathbb{R}}(J)=\emptyset, I(V(J))=I$ (empty) $=\mathbb{R}[x]$; here $J \subset I(V(J))$
- Over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$, let $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{q}-x\right\rangle$
- What is $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ? $I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ?
- $I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$ itself! We will prove it shortly...


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}+1\right\rangle, V_{\mathbb{R}}(J)=\emptyset, I(V(J))=I$ (empty) $=\mathbb{R}[x]$; here $J \subset I(V(J))$
- Over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$, let $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{q}-x\right\rangle$
- What is $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ? $I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ?
- $I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$ itself! We will prove it shortly...
- Is $V(J)=V(I(V(J)))$ ? Yes, it is!


## Some more about $I(V(J))$

- Given ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $J \subseteq I(V(J))$, but equality may not occur
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle, I(V(J))=\langle x, y\rangle$ which shows $J \subset I(V(J))$
- $J=\langle x, y\rangle, I(V(J))=J$; equality holds in this case
- $J=\left\langle x^{2}+1\right\rangle, V_{\mathbb{R}}(J)=\emptyset, I(V(J))=I$ (empty) $=\mathbb{R}[x]$; here $J \subset I(V(J))$
- Over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$, let $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{q}-x\right\rangle$
- What is $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ? $I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$ ?
- $I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$ itself! We will prove it shortly...
- Is $V(J)=V(I(V(J)))$ ? Yes, it is!
- Always remember that $V(J)$ is always taken over an ACF unless specified otherwise


## Still some more about $I(V(J))$

- Prove that $I(V(J))$ is an ideal
- Show that:
- $0 \in I(V(J)$ (The zero element of the ring is in $I(V(J)))$
- For $f, g \in I(V(J)) \Longrightarrow f+g \in I(V(J))$
- For $f \in I(V(J)), h \in \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, then $f \cdot h \in I(V(J))$
- The concept of $I(V(J))$ is valid over any ring (not necessarily algebraically closed)
- Finally, some more examples: $J=\left\langle x^{2}, y^{2}\right\rangle$
- $f_{1}=x+y, f_{2}=x \cdot y ; f_{1}, f_{2} \notin J, f_{1}, f_{2} \in I(V(J))$
- $f_{3}=x\left(x+y^{2}\right)=x^{2}+x y^{2} ; f_{3} \in J$ and so obviously $f_{3} \in I(V(J))$


## Regular Nullstellensatz

- Previous examples show that the reason why different ideals can have the same variety is that: for $a \in V(J), f(a)=0$ as well as $f^{m}(a)=0$ but $\left(I_{1}=\langle f\rangle\right) \neq\left(I_{2}=\left\langle f^{m}\right\rangle\right)$


## Theorem (Regular Nullstellensatz)

Let $\overline{\mathbb{F}}$ be an algebraically closed field. Let $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subset \overline{\mathbb{F}}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$. Let another polynomial $f$ vanish on $V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}}}(J)$, so $f \in I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}}}(J)\right)$. Then, $\exists m \in \mathbb{Z}_{\geq 1}$ s.t.

$$
f^{m} \in J,
$$

and conversely.

Its proof is very interesting and important. Described very well in [Cox/Little/O'Shea]. Proof covered in class.

## Decipher the following from the proof of Regular Nullstellensatz

Given $\mathbb{F}=\mathrm{ACF}, J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ such that $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then the following statements are equivalent (i.e. implications $\Longleftrightarrow$ work both ways)

- $f \in I(V(J))$


## Decipher the following from the proof of Regular Nullstellensatz

Given $\mathbb{F}=\mathrm{ACF}, J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ such that $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then the following statements are equivalent (i.e. implications $\Longleftrightarrow$ work both ways)

- $f \in I(V(J))$
- $f^{m} \in J$ for some integer $m \geq 1$


## Decipher the following from the proof of Regular Nullstellensatz

Given $\mathbb{F}=\mathrm{ACF}, J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ such that $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then the following statements are equivalent (i.e. implications $\Longleftrightarrow$ work both ways)

- $f \in I(V(J))$
- $f^{m} \in J$ for some integer $m \geq 1$
- $V\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\emptyset$ for the ideal $J^{\prime}=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, 1-y f\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, y\right]$


## Decipher the following from the proof of Regular Nullstellensatz

Given $\mathbb{F}=\mathrm{ACF}, J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ such that $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then the following statements are equivalent (i.e. implications $\Longleftrightarrow$ work both ways)

- $f \in I(V(J))$
- $f^{m} \in J$ for some integer $m \geq 1$
- $V\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\emptyset$ for the ideal $J^{\prime}=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, 1-y f\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, y\right]$
- Given $J$, can you think of an approach to test if $f \in I(V(J))$ ? Note, you're given generators of $J$, not the generators of $I(V(J))$


## Decipher the following from the proof of Regular Nullstellensatz

Given $\mathbb{F}=\mathrm{ACF}, J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ such that $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then the following statements are equivalent (i.e. implications $\Longleftrightarrow$ work both ways)

- $f \in I(V(J))$
- $f^{m} \in J$ for some integer $m \geq 1$
- $V\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\emptyset$ for the ideal $J^{\prime}=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, 1-y f\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, y\right]$
- Given $J$, can you think of an approach to test if $f \in I(V(J))$ ? Note, you're given generators of $J$, not the generators of $I(V(J))$
- $f \in I(V(J)) \Longleftrightarrow V\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\emptyset \Longleftrightarrow 1 \in J^{\prime} \Longleftrightarrow$ reduced $\mathrm{GB}\left(J^{\prime}\right)=$ \{1\}


## Decipher the following from the proof of Regular Nullstellensatz

Given $\mathbb{F}=\mathrm{ACF}, J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ such that $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then the following statements are equivalent (i.e. implications $\Longleftrightarrow$ work both ways)

- $f \in I(V(J))$
- $f^{m} \in J$ for some integer $m \geq 1$
- $V\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\emptyset$ for the ideal $J^{\prime}=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, 1-y f\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, y\right]$
- Given $J$, can you think of an approach to test if $f \in I(V(J))$ ? Note, you're given generators of $J$, not the generators of $I(V(J))$
- $f \in I(V(J)) \Longleftrightarrow V\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\emptyset \Longleftrightarrow 1 \in J^{\prime} \Longleftrightarrow$ reduced $\mathrm{GB}\left(J^{\prime}\right)=$ \{1\}
- Careful: $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ whereas $J^{\prime}=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, 1-y f\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, y\right]$


## Radical Ideals: Ideals with some special properties

We need to study one more type of ideal, called a radical ideal $\sqrt{J}$, that is related to $J$ :

- In a general setting: $J \subset \sqrt{J} \subset I(V(J))$
- Over an ACF: $I(V(J))=\sqrt{J}$ (This is the Strong Nullstellensatz)


## Lemma

If $f^{m} \in I(V(J))$ then $f \in I(V(J))$

## Definition

An ideal $I$ is radical if $f^{m} \in I$ (for some $m \geq 1$ ) implies that $f \in I$

## Lemma

From the Lemma and Definition above, it follows that the ideal $I(V(J))$ is radical.

## How to find out whether an ideal is radical?

- For any (and all) polynomials $f$, such that $f^{m} \in J$ for some $m \geq 1$
- If $f^{m} \in J$ implies that $f \in J$
- Then the ideal $J$ has the property that it is radical
- If you find a counter-example polynomial $f$ with no $m$ such that $f^{m} \in J$ implying $f \in J$, then $J$ is not radical


## Example (Counter-example for Radical Ideal)

Let $J=\left\langle x^{3}\right\rangle$. Pick $f=x$. Does there exist some $m$, s.t. $f^{m} \in J$ while also implies that $f \in J$ ? No. E.g., consider $m=3$ such that $f^{3}=x^{3} \in J$. But that does not imply $f \in J$. This is true for all $m \geq 3$. Ideal $J$ is NOT radical.

Now consider the example on the next slide

## How to find out whether an ideal is radical?

## Example

Let $J=\left\langle x^{2}, x^{4}-x\right\rangle \subset \mathbb{F}_{4}[x]$. Note $x^{4}-x$ is a vanishing polynomial in $\mathbb{F}_{4}[x]$.

- Pick any polynomial $f$ such that $f^{m} \in J$ for some $m \geq 1$
- Say, $f=x$, then for $m=2$, we have $f^{2}=x^{2} \in J$ :
- But this also implies that $f \in J$ :
- $f=x=x^{2} \cdot\left(x^{2}\right)-1 \cdot\left(x^{4}-x\right)$; so $f \in J$
- Similarly, pick $f=\alpha x^{2}+\alpha^{2} x$ for $\alpha \in \mathbb{F}_{4}$
- $\exists m=2: f^{m}=f^{2}=\alpha^{2} x^{4}+\alpha^{4} x^{2}$, so $f^{m} \in J$ for some $m$
- Notice that $f^{m} \in J$ implies that $f \in J$
- $f=\alpha x^{2}+\alpha^{2} x=\alpha x^{2}+\alpha^{2} \cdot\left(x^{2} \cdot x^{2}-\left(x^{4}-x\right)\right)$ so $f \in J$
- The argument can be shown to hold for all $f$ that $\exists m: f^{m} \in J \Longrightarrow f \in J$
- Clearly the ideal $J=\left\langle x^{2}, x^{4}-x\right\rangle \subset \mathbb{F}_{4}[x]$ is radical!


## Radical Tests?

- Given an ideal $J$, is there an algorithm to find if it is radical?
- In theory, yes, but in practice this is infeasible
- An ideal may or may not be radical
- If an ideal $J$ is NOT radical, then one can compute the Radical of $J$
- Radical of $J$ is denoted as $\sqrt{J}$, where $\sqrt{ }$. is just a "symbol"
- If the ideal $J$ is itself radical, then computing the "radical of $J$ " gives $J$ itself, i.e. $\sqrt{J}=J$
- Definition of $\sqrt{J}$ ?


## Please read and understand the following two concepts

From Cox/Little/O'Shea:
An ideal $\mathbf{I}=I(V(J))$ consisting of all polynomials that vanish on $V(J)$, has the property that if $f^{m} \in \mathbf{I}=I(V(J))$ then it implies that
$f \in \mathbf{I}=I(V(J))$.
But that is the definition of a radical ideal: so $\mathbf{I}=I(V(J))$ is also a radical ideal
$\sqrt{J}$ : The Radical of $J$
Let $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ be an ideal. The radical of $J$, denoted $\sqrt{J}$ is the set:

$$
\sqrt{J}=\left\{f: f^{m} \in J, \text { for some } m \geq 1\right\}
$$

An ideal is radical when $J=\sqrt{J}$.
Explain with Examples!

## Examples for $J, \sqrt{J}$

The Radical of $J$ is the smallest ideal containing $J$, which is also radical. It is possible to have $J \subset \sqrt{J} \subset J_{1}$ where $J_{1}$ is a radical ideal but it is different from the Radical of $J$.

## Example

Let $J=\left\langle x^{2}\right\rangle$
i) $\sqrt{J}=\langle x\rangle$
ii) $J_{1}=\langle x, y\rangle$ is a radical ideal, but $J_{1} \neq \sqrt{J}$
iii) $J \subset \sqrt{J} \subset J_{1}$
iv) $J_{1}=\sqrt{J_{1}}$, since $J_{1}$ is a radical ideal too

Given J, Singular provides a library function to compute the Radical of $J$ (OK for small problems). See the Singular file uploaded along with these slides. The procedure radical ( J ) is available through LIB "primdec.lib" in Singular.

## The Strong Nullstellensatz

## Theorem (The Strong Nullstellensatz)

Over an algebraically closed field $I(V(J))=\sqrt{J}$
To prove $I(V(J))=\sqrt{J}$ :

- Prove that $\sqrt{J} \subset I(V(J))$
- Take an arbitrary polynomial $f \in \sqrt{J}$. This implies $f^{m} \in J$ (definition of a radical ideal)
- Then $f^{m}$ vanishes on $V(J)$, so $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$
- So, $f \in I(V(J))$. Therefore, $\sqrt{J} \subset I(V(J))$
- Prove that $\sqrt{J} \supset I(V(J))$
- Let $f \in I(V(J))$. Then $f^{m} \in J$ (Regular Nullstellensatz)
- If $f^{m} \in J$ then $f \in \sqrt{J}$
- Since both $I(V(J))$ and $\sqrt{J}$ contain each other, they are equal


## Radical Membership Testing

Given generators of $J$, it is not always computationally feasible to identify generators of $\sqrt{J}$. But, it is possible to test for membership in $\sqrt{J}$, given $J$.

Theorem (Radical Membership)
Let $\mathbb{F}$ be a arbitrary field. Let $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$ be an ideal. Then a polynomial $f \in \sqrt{J} \Longleftrightarrow 1 \in J^{\prime} \Longleftrightarrow \operatorname{reduced} G B\left(J^{\prime}\right)=\{1\}$ where:

$$
J^{\prime}=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}, 1-y \cdot f\right\rangle \subset \mathbb{F}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, y\right]
$$

and $y$ is a new variable.

## Consolidating the results

- Associated with an ideal $J$, there are two more ideals $\sqrt{J}, I(V(J))$
- In general: $J \subset \sqrt{J} \subset I(V(J))$
- Over ACF: $\sqrt{J}=I(V(J))$
- They have same solutions: $V(J)=V(\sqrt{J})=V(I(V(J)))$ over ACF
- If $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$, then $f \in I(V(J))=\sqrt{J}$
- If $J$ is radical, then $J=\sqrt{J}=I(V(J))$
- Given $J$, we cannot easily find generators of $\sqrt{J}$
- But we can test for membership in $\sqrt{J}$
- $f \in \sqrt{J} \Longleftrightarrow$ reducedGB $(J+\langle 1-y \cdot f\rangle)=\{1\}$
- $V\left(J_{1}\right)=V\left(J_{2}\right) \Longleftrightarrow \sqrt{J_{1}}=\sqrt{J_{2}}$

Intuitively: Proving equality of circuits may not imply equality of ideal, but rather equality of their radicals!

## Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

Given an ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}_{q}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, and let $J_{0}=\left\langle x_{1}^{q}-x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}^{q}-x_{n}\right\rangle$

- $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$


## Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

Given an ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}_{q}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, and let $J_{0}=\left\langle x_{1}^{q}-x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}^{q}-x_{n}\right\rangle$

- $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$
- What is $\sqrt{J_{0}}$ ?


## Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

Given an ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}_{q}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, and let $J_{0}=\left\langle x_{1}^{q}-x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}^{q}-x_{n}\right\rangle$

- $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$
- What is $\sqrt{J_{0}}$ ?
- $\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$. IOW, $J_{0}$ is a radical ideal. Prove it.


## Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

Given an ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}_{q}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, and let $J_{0}=\left\langle x_{1}^{q}-x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}^{q}-x_{n}\right\rangle$

- $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$
- What is $\sqrt{J_{0}}$ ?
- $\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$. IOW, $J_{0}$ is a radical ideal. Prove it.
- $I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$


## Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

Given an ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}_{q}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, and let $J_{0}=\left\langle x_{1}^{q}-x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}^{q}-x_{n}\right\rangle$

- $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$
- What is $\sqrt{J_{0}}$ ?
- $\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$. IOW, $J_{0}$ is a radical ideal. Prove it.
- $I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$


## Nullstellensatz over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

Given an ideal $J=\left\langle f_{1}, \ldots, f_{s}\right\rangle \subseteq \mathbb{F}_{q}\left[x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right]$, and let $J_{0}=\left\langle x_{1}^{q}-x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}^{q}-x_{n}\right\rangle$

- $I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=J_{0}$
- What is $\sqrt{J_{0}}$ ?
- $\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$. IOW, $J_{0}$ is a radical ideal. Prove it.
- $I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=\sqrt{J_{0}}=J_{0}$


## Proof: $J_{0}=I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=\sqrt{J_{0}}$

Take an arbitrary $f \in J_{0}$, so $f$ is a vanishing polynomial over $\mathbb{F}_{q}$. It vanishes everywhere, so it vanishes on $V\left(J_{0}\right)$ too. Hence, $f \in I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$. Conversely, take $f \in I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$, then $f^{m} \in J_{0}$ (Regular Nullstellensatz). Which means $f^{m}$ is a vanishing polynomial. $f^{m}=0$ everywhere $\Longleftrightarrow f=0$ everywhere. This means $f \in J_{0}$. This proves $J_{0}=I\left(V\left(J_{0}\right)\right)$.

Since $V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)=V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)$, we have: $J_{0}=I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J_{0}\right)\right)=\sqrt{J_{0}}$

## Life is easy over Galois fields $\mathbb{F}_{q}$

## Theorem ( $J+J_{0}$ is radical)

Over Galois fields $\sqrt{J+J_{0}}=J+J_{0}$, i.e. $J+J_{0}$ is a radical ideal.
Note: $J$ is an arbitrary ideal, and $J_{0}$ is the ideal of all vanishing polynomials. $J_{0}$ is radical, $J$ may or may not be radical, but $J+J_{0}$ becomes radical! Proof is attached separately.

## Example

I showed you on previous slides that $J=\left\langle x^{2}\right\rangle$ and $J_{0}=\left\langle x^{4}-x\right\rangle$, then $J+J_{0}=\left\langle x^{2}, x^{4}-x\right\rangle \subset \mathbb{F}_{4}[x]$ is radical, i.e. $J+J_{0}=\sqrt{J+J_{0}}$

Theorem (Strong Nullstellensatz over $\mathbb{F}_{q}$ )
$I\left(V_{\mathbb{F}_{q}}(J)\right)=I\left(V_{\overline{\mathbb{F}_{q}}}\left(J+J_{0}\right)\right)=\sqrt{J+J_{0}}=J+J_{0}$

## Apply Strong Nullstellensatz to Circuit Verification

- Now we will apply the Strong Nullstellensatz over $\mathbb{F}_{q}$ to verify circuits
- Formulate as $f$ vanishes on $V(J)$
- So $f \in I(V(J))$
- We know that over Galois fields, $I(V(J))=J+J_{0}$
- So test if $f \in J+J_{0}$ or test of $f \xrightarrow{G B\left(J+J_{0}\right)}+0$ ?
- The challenge is to do this verification in a scalable fashion
- Next set of slides...

